ABSTRACT
This paper identified the level of green marketing practices of selected food processing industries in Baguio City in terms of Strategic Green Marketing Orientation (SGMO), Tactical Green Marketing Orientation (TGMO), and Internal Green Marketing Orientation (IGMO). It seeks to know the implementation of green marketing orientation in the food processing industry in Baguio City in terms of SGMO, TGMO, IGMO; and to find the level of implementation of green marketing orientation across years of operation and nature of business which attest if there is significant difference in the level of implementation of green marketing orientation across years of operation and nature of business of the food processing industry. The researcher used survey questionnaire and interview. There were 65 respondents for the survey and 6 supervisors comprised the key informants in the interview. The results from the interview were used to validate the results from the quantitative analysis. It is found out that IGMO practices are moderately implemented in the food processing industry. It is also noted that both TGMO and SGMO were equally implemented by the different business firms. In this connection, the level of implementation of green marketing across years of operation and nature of business of the food industry proved that SGMO is moderately implemented while TGMO and IGMO are implemented.

KEYWORDS: Strategic Green Marketing Orientation, Tactical Green Marketing Orientation, Internal Green Marketing Orientation, Marketing Mix & Marketing Performance
sustainable food marketing in terms of recapturing value from their products and by-products, reducing operating costs, and also using natural resources in an efficient way; hence, green marketing practices involve ways to achieve better business marketing performance originating from the human values and ethics of global responsibility and of sustaining the environment rooted in recognizing the importance of people and the ecosystem and their places. The study of Jain and Kaur (2014) argued that firms are blamed for producing harmful products that lead to environmental degradation, whereas the customers who demand goods create environmental problems.

In the Philippines, the implementation of laws as well as city and provincial ordinances related to the preservation of the environment in local and the national government has been enacted to address environmental issues and problems, such as the Zero Plastic Use of 2017, the Air and Water Protection, Philippine Water Act of 2004, and the Clean Air Act of 1999. Aside from the above-mentioned laws, the Local Government Units serve as the watch dog in reminding barangays or towns of their environmental actions. In Baguio City, Ordinance No. 35 series of 2017 “The Plastic and Styrofoam-Free Baguio Ordinance,” covers all business activities and establishments in the city including government schools and offices. Residents are highly encouraged to practice in their daily chores the 5Rs namely; reduce, reuse, and recycle, refuse, and reform (repurpose).

Theoretical/Conceptual Framework

The framework of this study was based on the ethical thoughts of Emmanuel Levinas specifically the so called Levenisian ethics of the encounter with, openness to the other, also known as “The Entre Nous as Thinking-of-the-Other.” The main idea of the ‘thinking of the other’ is not to subjugate or dominate the other; instead, it is to be responsible of the responsibility of the other without expectation (Garber, Hanssen, & Walkowitz, 2000). The philosophy of Levinas is applied to businesses and corporations as he expanded the meaning of “the other” to different levels. The first of which are the shareholders and the duty of prudence, its internal and external stakeholders, employees, the community, and the environment. However, Levinas put emphasis on the consumer as the ultimate “other” where their business is derived. This research expounded the philosophy of Levinas in the context of environmental responsibility. Specifically, this focused research on the green marketing orientation as one of the infinite responsibilities of a company towards its consumers (Becker, 2013). The green marketing orientation is built around the customer and the relationship between customer and the organization. The firm will unlikely be able to work through the changes they want and move towards sustainability if green marketing is viewed with cynicism and distrust by its consumers. They bear the responsibility towards the community to which the business is situated, including sound legal and ethical practices, practice social responsibility towards the environment through “green” practices.

Green Marketing Orientation

Green marketing is part of the corporate environmental responsibility of a business entity. This means that businesses make a conscious effort to reduce the adverse effect of environmental degradation in their business practices. Food processing industries can make this by reducing its use of plastic, choosing a better waste disposal, as well as following legislation on green practices in the locality. Therefore, business leaders particularly in the food processing industry must take the necessary steps to intertwine the relationship of the organization towards their stakeholders; taking into account the well-being of the society and create a positive social engagement and environmental long term sustainable impact (Becker,
It is evident that green marketing and demands in the market specifically in the food processing industry will only have a positive impact on the environment if management changes its values, strategies, policies, and regulation. Food processing businesses must implement a green marketing orientation which includes: recycling, fair exchange and competition, product-service substitutions, energy efficiency and less materialistic ways of life will also need to be marketed (Peattie & Charter, 2003). Thereby, Levinas used the term “infinite responsibility”. Levinas posited that to escape from this responsibility is impossible wherein business leaders are enjoined to incorporate a green marketing orientation in their business strategies. This is possible when the entire business organization has embraced the importance of such philosophy.

One study commissioned by the Department of Trade and Industry (DTI) - Philippines and executed by Global Green Growth Institute (GGGI) and ASSIST Asia on Best Green Business Practices among MSMEs focused into the 12 selected MSMEs in their processing and manufacturing processed of selected food processing in the country. The findings exhibited a strong evidence of MSMEs contributions in sustainable development goal such as decent work and economic growth, organic farming is the most practiced greening interventions of the enterprise such as water use, energy use, use of biodegradable materials/reused materials, for packaging and distribution, waste treatment as well as emission. In 2009, Department of Environment and Natural Resources (DENR) launched a book entitled “Greening Industries in the Philippines” which highlighted green government policies, program and initiatives towards greening of industries, DENR green growth programs, among others. The study of Green Marketing Orientation (GMO), conceptualization, scale development and validation by Papadas, Avlonitis, & Carrigan (2017) provided a platform for managers with a comprehensive view that contain what constitutes a green marketing orientation, and how it could be integrated and operationalized for external and internal effect. This researcher now takes the opportunity to further validate the proposed theory of Papadas et al. (2017) and explore the significance of a Green Marketing Orientation for an organization’s success.

Figure 1: Representation of a Business Model with Green Marketing Orientation (adapted in Papadas et.al 2017)

The business model shown in Figure 1 reflects the operationalization of the theoretical framework of the study.

www.tjpco.org

editor@tjpco.org
The concept of a business model is useful as it provides managers and researchers a means to describe and distinguish between types of business behaviour. It functions as a “recipe” that draws together different elements of the business activity to be arranged and combined together in various new and novel ways. Business models are “far from being a quantum of information that is revealed in a flash, it is typically a complex set of interdependent routines discovered, adjusted and fine-tuned by doing”. As developed and introduced by Papadas et.al (2017), Strategic Green Marketing Orientation (SGMO) refers to a long-term, top management actions and policies specifically focusing on corporate environmental strategy; proactive environmental strategies, and external environmental stakeholders. These are the strategic directions implemented by the business to create the proper behaviours for the continuous superior performance of the business and that includes concepts that examine the package of managerial choices to further achieve the business objectives. Strategic green marketing orientation is also represented as the element of the organization’s culture that guides interactions with the marketplace: that is, the customers and the competitors (Chahal, Dangwal & Raina, 2014).

The Internal Green Marketing Orientation (IGMO) involves the incorporation of environmental values across the companies to embrace a wider organization’s green culture. Some of the examples are employee training; efforts to stress environmental awareness inside the organization, promoting environmental leadership activities within and outside the organization. Environmental activities to educate and train employees for green marketing across the whole business can lead to environmental champions (Papadas et al. 2017). Businesses can be one of the identified entities to practice environmental and social concerns which can effect change by reducing the environmental impact of their actions (Woolverton & Dmitri 2010). The companies practicing the philosophy of green marketing will gain competitive advantage and sustainable consumption in the market place; and will enjoy sustainable development through green marketing.

![Figure 2: Research Paradigm](image)

The figure explains the operational framework of the study which focused on the level of implementation of green marketing orientation and practice by selected food processing industry in Baguio City. The independent variable is the strategic green marketing orientation (SGMO), tactical green marketing orientation (TGMO) and the internal green marketing orientation (IGMO).
marketing orientation (IGMO) as the engine for the food processing industry. These are distinguished in terms of the type of the business and its years of operation. The food processing industry was categorized based on the classification of the Department of Trade and Industry. They are as follows: fruits and nuts manufacturing, fish and poultry processing, bakery and bakeshop, water refilling station, and beverage and herbal tea. They were also classified according to the industry’s years of operation. The variables and themes are interrelated with regards to marketing mix and marketing performance.

In particular, this study tried to uncover the connection of the underlining philosophy of Levinas about caring for other in the current green marketing orientation practices of business leaders in the food processing industry in Baguio City. The variables were measured in relation to its level of marketing mix and marketing performance. The research problems were as follows:

- What is the implementation of green marketing orientation in the food processing industry in Baguio City in terms of Strategic green marketing orientation (SGMO), Tactical green marketing orientation (TGMO), Internal green marketing orientation (IGMO)?
- What is the level of implementation of green marketing orientation across years of operation and nature of business of the food processing industry and to test if there is a significant difference in the level of implementation of green marketing orientation across years of operation and nature of business of the food processing industry?

There were a few studies on green marketing in the Philippines which offers a new learning paradigm in the academe, business industry, and the government which discourses the building of body of knowledge. For the academe, a holistic knowledge on green marketing orientation that will be developed from the lived experiences of business leaders provided a new theory about green marketing in the local context.

**METHODS**

Green marketing is a broad issue that its study benefits from the coherent integration of both qualitative and quantitative approaches to gather data and insights and process those feedbacks into meaningful data. The research design is also descriptive where it investigated the business leaders’ level of implementation of green marketing orientation from the data sources. There were 65 respondents belonging to the identified food processing industries. There are six selected business leaders who answered the structured interview question to gather their feedback and insights about their implementation of green marketing orientation.

A survey questionnaire was developed and improved using the guide questions from Papadas et.al (2017), and re-adapted and improved to suit the current location of the study. A structured interview question about the implementation of green marketing orientation and its effect on marketing performance was used as an instrument for data gathering.

To determine the implementation of green marketing orientation in the food processing industry in Baguio City in terms of Strategic green marketing (SGMO), Tactical green marketing (TGMO), Internal green marketing (IGMO), weighted mean is used. The qualitative data was used to support the quantitative result, since the interview participants were managers, business owners, and supervisors. They answered the questions in English fluently without the need for translators. The researcher selected the quotes or answers of the interviewee that were affecting and or most representative of the research findings on the quantitative data. The large portions of an interview were included in the results and discussion. Based from the study of Corden and Sainsbury (2006), verbatim presentation of qualitative data is deemed
RESULTS AND DISCUSSIONS

Strategic Green Marketing Orientation

The first set of questions dealt with the Strategic Green Orientation (SGMO) and the implementation of such across the participating industries. This sought to ascertain certain green orientation practices which they incorporate in their business.

Table 1: Implementation of Strategic Green Marketing Orientation (SGMO) by Food Processing Industry

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Food Processing Industry</th>
<th>SGMO</th>
<th>SD</th>
<th>Interpretation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Beverage, herbal tea</td>
<td>3.75</td>
<td>0.58</td>
<td>Implemented</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fruits and nuts manufacturing</td>
<td>3.71</td>
<td>0.77</td>
<td>Implemented</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Water refilling station</td>
<td>3.33</td>
<td>0.84</td>
<td>Moderately Implemented</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fish and poultry processing</td>
<td>2.98</td>
<td>1.17</td>
<td>Moderately Implemented</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bakery and bakeshop</td>
<td>2.85</td>
<td>1.16</td>
<td>Moderately Implemented</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 1 presents the summary of SGMO according to food processing industry. The results showed that the beverage, herbal tea and fruits and nuts manufacturing implemented the practices of the SGMO, while all others moderately implemented it. In the interview with the supervisor of fruits and vegetable processing, they said that it is important for them to pass some relevant environmental government certifications in order to comply with the requirements of the city in terms of processing business permits. This is to ensure the quality of their products. The result of the study is the same with the study of Andrews & Dowling (2002) that pursuing certifications explores added supply chain, knowledge on customer’s satisfaction is broadened, and partnership to organizations with common objectives increases.

Water refilling station, fish and poultry processing, and bakery and bakeshop have a mean score of 3.33, 2.98, and 2.85 respectively indicating a moderately implemented strategic green marketing orientation. Some business leaders may have limited policies in incorporating environmental strategies and they also have inadequate engagement to external environmental stakeholders (Chahal, et.al. 2014). This is very important to keep them informed on the current thrust of the green marketing implementation in the city.

Tactical Green Marketing Orientation Implementation

Table 2 presents the summarized implementation of Tactical Green Marketing orientation (TGMO) in the City of Baguio. The result shows that the beverage and herbal tea business has the highest mean score with 3.65 and with a standard deviation of (0.76). Fish and poultry processing establishments surveyed were rated to moderately implement the TGMO initiatives. Business leaders in beverage and herbal tea in terms of materials tend to get their resources direct from farmers or from their own gardens. Business leaders in the fruits and nuts manufacturing on the other hand, have a direct contact with their suppliers on the needed resources to make the products. Business leaders in water refilling station establishments ensure that they comply with the government requirements in pursuit of carrying their business activities. They encourage customers to bring with them eco-bags in purchasing their needs, and that is to support the city ordinance of “no plastic use”. Business leaders also implement the 5Rs program (recycle, reduce, reuse, repurpose, and refuse. Bakery and
bakeshop, and fish and poultry processing with a weighted mean of 3.33, and 3.31 and the standard deviation of 0.94 and 0.98 respectively moderately implement the green marketing orientation initiatives. The selected business leaders do not consistently use reusable materials, due to their products are considered fresh produce. This is to protect the product from being contaminated. That is the reason why business leaders in this category of food processing industry cannot avoid using plastic.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table 2: Implementation of Tactical Green Marketing Orientation (TGMO) by Food Processing Industry</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>TGMO</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Beverage, herbal tea</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fruits and nuts manufacturing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Water refilling station</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bakery and bakeshop</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fish and poultry processing</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The result of the study conducted by Leonidou, et al. (2013), is similar to the findings of this paper that firms with limited or no slack resources will find it much more difficult to implement green marketing programs which in turn part of tactical green marketing orientation. Another is the inability to follow all regulations and guidelines that hinder organizations to implement green marketing orientation practices as well as the inability to present accurate message about the products and services as stated Valentine (2007). Adopting the practice of green marketing is still very difficult to implement because of consumer backlash against the product.

Table 3 indicates that among the nine indicators, there were five that moderately implemented the IGMO and the average standard deviation is 1.09. The acknowledgement of environmental exemplar behaviour, the environmental activities by candidates are bonus in the recruitment process, the forming of committees to conduct internal audit, and even the internal competitions to promote eco-friendly practices. This indicates that selected business leaders in the food processing industries believe that they are still considering the practices of giving rewards and acknowledgement to excellent performance that promotes green marketing. The inability of respond to green marketing practice is indirectly proportional to possible lessening of profit but the ability to respond properly to ethics of social responsibility. Green marketing strategy not only promotes care for the environment and people but can also have direct effect for gaining more profit.

**Internal Green Marketing Implementation**

Table 3 presents the summary of the implementation of IGMO by food processing industry. The results showed that the implementation of internal green marketing was highest in the fruits and nuts processing industry, followed by the water refilling station and the beverage and tea industry with a weighted mean of 3.96, 3.62, and 3.56 respectively. Within the group, the fish and poultry processing, and bakery and bakeshop businesses had the lowest rating mean indicating a moderate implementation of IGMO within their business processes. This shows the differing views of the food processing industries in terms of their integration of green best practices. It can be inferred that incorporating environmental practices must go beyond what the city ordinances expected of them, but to internalize green practices as part of the culture of the business. Business leaders in this industry are pressured to improve environmental and ethical concern (Ilbery & Maye, 2007) and to encourage their employees to practice eco-friendly activities in carrying out their duties and responsibilities.
(Chamorro & Banegil, 2006; Ottman, 1998). Two of the businesses surveyed yielded a moderate implementation of IGMO. While this may be due to high investment and technical cost in the production or promotion of a green product, the lack of orientation of its employees on green practices is also an area of consideration. The lack of support from the government and other stakeholders increases the ignorance and lack of understanding about green products and low customer delivered value, as a result, very few people buy green products (Lim et al., 2013).

Table 3: Implementation of Internal Green Marketing Orientation (IGMO) by Food Processing Industry

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Food Processing Industry</th>
<th>IGMO</th>
<th>SD</th>
<th>Interpretation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Fruits and nuts manufacturing</td>
<td>3.96</td>
<td>0.69</td>
<td>Implemented</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Water refilling station</td>
<td>3.62</td>
<td>1.00</td>
<td>Implemented</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Beverage, herbal tea</td>
<td>3.56</td>
<td>0.42</td>
<td>Implemented</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fish and poultry processing</td>
<td>2.93</td>
<td>1.16</td>
<td>Moderately implemented</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bakery and bakeshop</td>
<td>2.84</td>
<td>1.20</td>
<td>Moderately implemented</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Fundamentally, green marketing is also about ‘conservation,’ which is concerned chiefly with the sustainable use of resources by consumers rather than the protection of the ecosystem alone. The ethical responsibility to and for the other means the recognition of the organizational culture, because attitudes and behaviours can be internalized into the adoption of a more environmental friendly approach to business. The business organization must always take initiative to be responsible on the consequences of products’ appreciation, depreciation, or the possible damage it can have for nature.

The Baguio City ordinance on no plastic policy as well as the garbage segregation and proper waste disposal has helped the Baguio residents embrace a culture which is more environmental friendly. The supervisors during the interview said that these ordinances have changed their decisions on green marketing orientation. There is a proliferation of establishments that promote organic products in Baguio City such as the vegetarian stores, restaurants, and health bars. Some of the noted businesses are, Health 102 restaurant along General Luna Road, Health Invest store along Mabini Street, and Heaven on Earth Vegetarian Center in Abanao Square. Baguio City adheres to the United Nations Millennium Development Goals ‘to achieve universal primacy education’ so that, by “word of mouth” education regarding green marketing consciousness continue to develop (MDGs, 2015 quoted in J. Newman, 2011). Interviewee three said that they educate a green mindset to their customers by teaching them about the health benefits of the products. Over time, the number of their customers increased; as a result, the demand for organic products cannot meet the demands of its consumers. The result may imply that the supervisors, the owners of the different food processing industries have the same level of implementation regardless of the product that they offer to the consumers. The food processing industries moderately implemented their environmental values towards their employees with a weighted mean of 3.38. Some of them introduced IGMO practices through education and trainings. It is also noted that both TGMO and SGMO were equally implemented by the different business firms which was an indication that food processing industries have adjusted, supported, and implemented the environmental policies of the city. However, there was little reservation on its rigorous implementation.

CONCLUSIONS

Based on the results, SGMO and TGMO are equally implemented in the food processing industry except the IGMO which is moderately implemented in the city. SGMO indicates that the business firms observe ethics towards environment in their
business and create a separate department/unit specializing in environmental issues for our organization. In TGMO, the businesses encourage the consumers the use of e-commerce and prefer digital communication methods for promoting their products. On the other side, creating internal environmental prize competitions that promote eco-friendly competitions and rewarding exemplar environmental behaviour are still on the process of integrating it on all of the food processing industry. Overall, green marketing orientation in the food processing industries in Baguio City is implemented. The integration of environmental values across the organization to embrace a corporate green culture is also implemented in Baguio City.

REFERENCES


www.tjprc.org editor@tjprc.org


